Supreme Court, U. S.
FILED
DEC 17 1951
CHARLES ELMORE CROPLEY
CLERK

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

OCTOBER TERM, 1951

No. 481

This pt is a large folded Map - Placed in Packet at end of val-

HUMBLE OIL & REFINING COMPANY, ET AL., *Petitioners,*

v.

SUN OIL COMPANY, *Respondent*

United States Coast & Geodetic Survey Map Submitted By Petitioners With Petition For Writ of Certiorari to the United States Court of Appeals For the Fifth Circuit, And Brief in Support Thereof

---

GORDON BOONE,
ALLEN V. DAVIS,
JACOB S. FLOYD,
ROBERT H. KELLEY,
R. E. SEAGLER,
REX G. BAKER,
K. C. MINTER,
CHARLES E. SHAVER,
NELSON JONES,

Counsel for Petitioners

ALPHA LAW BRIEF CO., HOUSTON

JAN 14 1952
CHARLES ELMORE CROP

NO. 481

IN THE

Supreme Court of the United States

OCTOBER TERM, 1951

HUMBLE OIL & REFINING COMPANY, ET AL, *Petitioners*

v.

SUN OIL COMPANY, *Respondent*

ON PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE FIFTH CIRCUIT

BRIEF FOR RESPONDENT IN OPPOSITION

CHAS. D. TURNER
FRITZ L. LYNE
J. W. TIMMINS
MARTIN A. ROW
CARLTON R. WINN
Counsel for Respondent.

E. DUNCAN & CO., Brief Printers, 1829 E. Jefferson, Dallas, Texas

INDEX

Page

OPINIONS BELOW 1

QUESTION PRESENTED 2

JURISDICTION 3

STATEMENT 5

ARGUMENT 16

I. THE DECISION BELOW IS CLEARLY CORRECT 16

(1) Laguna Madre today is the same as it was when the mainland grants were issued in 1804, 1832 and 1834. Hence the field note calls in the mainland grants to extend eastward to Laguna Madre cannot conflict with it. (Reply to Specification of Error No. 1 of Petitioners.) 16

(2) There can be no accretion to the bed of the sea. (Reply to Petitioners' Specification of Error No. 2.) 25

(3) The respondent Sun proved a title by formal conveyance from the State of Texas, which owns the lands under the inland waters of Laguna Madre. (Reply to Petitioners' Specification of Error No. 3.) 29

(4) The respondent Sun has not made any "judicial admission" with respect to "accertion", and the lower courts were correct in so finding. (Reply to Petitioners' Specification of Error No. 4.) 32

Page

(5) This Court is not interested in reviewing again the facts which have been concurred in by the two lower courts. (Reply to Petitioners' Specification of Error No. 6.) 38

(6) This is an action in equity to remove cloud and to enjoin petitioners from interfering with respondent's development of oil and gas under its title which it holds from the State of Texas. (Reply to Petitioners' Specification of Error No. 5 and brief thereon, page 41.) 41

(7) Respondent Sun has not filed any disclaimer of its leasehold title under any of the sections, in Laguna Madre. (Reply to Petitioners' Specification of Error No. 7.) 44

CONCLUSION 46

CITATIONS

CASES:

Borax Consolidated v. City of Los Angeles, 296 U. S. 10, 56 S. Ct. 23, 80 L. Ed. 9 ..... 5, 21

City of Galveston v. Mann, 135 Tex. 319, 143 S. W. (2d) 1028 30

Fulton v. Frandolig, 63 Tex. 330 28

Graver Tank & Mfg. Co. v. Linde Air Products Co., 336 U. S. 271, 69 S. Ct. 535 38

Holland v. Challen, 110 U. S. 15, 3 S. Ct. 495, 28 L. Ed. 52 ..... 42, 44

Page

Kenedy Pasture Co. v. State, 111 Tex. 200, 231 S. W. 683 10

Landry v. Robison, 110 Tex. 295, 219 S.W. 819 30

Lorino v. Crawford Packing Co., 142 Tex. 51, 175 S.W. (2d) 410 30

Manry v. Robison, 122 Tex. 213, 56 S. W. (2d) 438 ..... 19, 20

State v. Balli, 144 Tex. 195, 190 S.W. (2d) 71.. 2, 3, 4, 6, 18, 19, 20, 26, 27, 45

State v. Delesdenier, 7 Tex. 76 31

State v. Sais, 47 Tex. 307 10

Swift & Co. v. Hocking Valley Ry. Co., 243 U.S. 281, 37 S. Ct. 287, 61 L. Ed. 722 33

U. S. v. Yellow Cab Co., 338 U.S. 338, 70 S. Ct. 177 38-9

RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE:

Rule 52(a), Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, 28 U.S.C.A. 1, 40

STATUTES:

Article 5415a, Revised Civil Statutes of Texas, 1925 10

Article 5421c-3, Revised Civil Statutes of Texas, 1925 (Acts 1939, 46th Leg., p. 465, § 5) 30

Page

Article 7364, Revised Civil Statutes of Texas, 1925 43

THE CIVIL LAW:

Angell on Tidewaters (Joseph K. Angell, 2ed, Rev. 1847) 21

THE ROMAN LAW:

Digest, Book 50, Title 16, Sec. 112 22

Institutes of Justinian, Book II, Title I, Sec. II 21, 22

THE SPANISH LAW:

LAS SIETE PARTIDAS:

1555, Official Translation, Gregorio Lopez .. 20, 23

1820, Translation of L. Moreau Lislet & Henry Carleton (Printed by James M'Karaher, New Orleans) 23

1839, Translation by Joseph M. White ("Recopilacion"; T. & J. W. Johnson, Law Booksellers, Philadelphia) 24

1931, Translation by S. P. Scott (for The Comparative Law Bureau of the American Bar Association; publ. Commerce Clearing House) 20

INDEX—Continued

Page

EXHIBITS

Plaintiff's Exhibit 3, Respondent Sun's Ground Map of Laguna Madre ..... Appendix

Plaintiff's Exhibit 614, showing Bob Tanner's Seaplane taking off from the waters of Laguna Madre 28a